Appendix C  Addendum to Stage 1
Statement of Heritage Impact
Northern Beaches Hospital Connectivity and Network Enhancements

Addendum to Stage 1 Statement of Heritage Impact, Frenchs Forest, NSW

Prepared by:

RPS MANIDIS ROBERTS PTY LTD

Level 9, 17 York Street
Sydney NSW 2000

T: +61 2 9248 7800
F: +61 2 9248 7810
E: sydney@rpsgroup.com.au

Client Manager: Lyndall Thornhill
Report Number: PR120633-1
Version / Date: Draft REV A, March 2015

Prepared for:

SMEC

PO Box 1052
NORTH SYDNEY NSW 2059

Attention: Braith Gilchrist
IMPORTANT NOTE

Apart from fair dealing for the purposes of private study, research, criticism, or review as permitted under the Copyright Act, no part of this report, its attachments or appendices may be reproduced by any process without the written consent of RPS Manidis Roberts Pty Ltd. All enquiries should be directed to RPS Manidis Roberts Pty Ltd.

We have prepared this report for the sole purposes of Roads and Maritime Services ("Client") for the specific purpose of only for which it is supplied ("Purpose"). This report is strictly limited to the purpose and the facts and matters stated in it and does not apply directly or indirectly and will not be used for any other application, purpose, use or matter.

In preparing this report we have made certain assumptions. We have assumed that all information and documents provided to us by the Client or as a result of a specific request or enquiry were complete, accurate and up-to-date. Where we have obtained information from a government register or database, we have assumed that the information is accurate. Where an assumption has been made, we have not made any independent investigations with respect to the matters the subject of that assumption. We are not aware of any reason why any of the assumptions are incorrect.

This report is presented without the assumption of a duty of care to any other person (other than the Client) ("Third Party"). The report may not contain sufficient information for the purposes of a Third Party or for other uses. Without the prior written consent of RPS Manidis Roberts Pty Ltd:

(a) this report may not be relied on by a Third Party; and

(b) RPS Manidis Roberts Pty Ltd will not be liable to a Third Party for any loss, damage, liability or claim arising out of or incidental to a Third Party publishing, using or relying on the facts, content, opinions or subject matter contained in this report.

If a Third Party uses or relies on the facts, content, opinions or subject matter contained in this report with or without the consent of RPS Manidis Roberts Pty Ltd, RPS Manidis Roberts Pty Ltd disclaims all risk and the Third Party assumes all risk and releases and indemnifies and agrees to keep indemnified RPS Manidis Roberts Pty Ltd from any loss, damage, claim or liability arising directly or indirectly from the use of or reliance on this report.

In this note, a reference to loss and damage includes past and prospective economic loss, loss of profits, damage to property, injury to any person (including death) costs and expenses incurred in taking measures to prevent, mitigate or rectify any harm, loss of opportunity, legal costs, compensation, interest and any other direct, indirect, consequential or financial or other loss.

Document Status

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Version</th>
<th>Purpose of Document</th>
<th>Orig</th>
<th>Review</th>
<th>Review Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Draft REV A</td>
<td>Addendum to Stage 1 SoHI to amend impact on part of the “Former Holland’s Orchard and Commemorative Grove”</td>
<td>D. Farina</td>
<td>E. Williams</td>
<td>11/03/2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Approval for Issue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Signature</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Erin Williams</td>
<td>[Signature]</td>
<td>11 March 2015</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1.0 INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................................................................... 1
  1.1 Location and Description ............................................................................................................ 1
  1.2 Proposed works ........................................................................................................................... 2
  1.3 Limitations .................................................................................................................................... 2
  1.4 Authorship .................................................................................................................................... 2

2.0 SIGNIFICANCE AND IMPACT ASSESSMENT ...................................................................................... 4
  2.1 Significance Assessment ............................................................................................................ 4
  2.2 Impact Assessment ..................................................................................................................... 5

3.0 MITIGATION MEASURES AND RECOMMENDATION ........................................................................... 7
Tables

Table 1-5 Acknowledgements ........................................................................................................................................2

Figures

Figure 1: Heritage items in the vicinity of the proposed works ....................................................................................3

Plates

Plate 1: Remnant pear tree from former Holland’s Orchard, looking south west (RPS, 2014) .................................2

Appendices

Appendix 1  Inventory Sheet from State Heritage Inventory
1.0 Introduction

In October 2014, RPS finalised a Statement of Heritage Impact on behalf of SMEC and Roads and Maritime Service (RMS) over the Stage 1 area of the Northern Beaches Hospital Connectivity and Network Enhancements. That report concluded inter alia that there would be no impact to the heritage significance of the heritage listed Former Holland’s Orchard and Commemorative Grove, in particular the last remaining pear tree from the former Holland’s Orchard, located along Warringah Road.

Recent proposed changes to the design of utilities in the vicinity of the pear tree have necessitated this addendum, which will reassess the level of impact to heritage significance of the Former Holland’s Orchard and Commemorative Grove. This report will also recommend mitigation and management measures for the tree. This report should be read in conjunction with the Stage 1 Statement of Heritage Impact.

1.1 Location and Description

The Former Holland’s Orchard and Commemorative Grove is located adjacent to Warringah Road and within The Forest High School grounds. The original pear tree from which the commemorative grove was propagated is located adjacent to Forest High School on the northern verge of Warringah Road, approximately midway between Forest Way and the Wakehurst Parkway (see Figure 1). The commemorative grove is located within the grounds of The Forest High School. The original pear tree is approximately four metres in height. It is currently listed in Schedule 5 of the Warringah Local Environmental Plan 2011 as an item of local significance.

When the pear tree was first listed as a heritage item, it was one of two trees, however the other tree died, although its stump are still located approximately 2-3 metres to the east of the remaining tree (see Plate 1).
1.2 Proposed works

The proposed works involve laying of utility services along the alignment of the current concrete footpath on Warringah Road, adjacent to the pear tree. These works will have a direct physical impact on the pear tree.

For further information regarding the Stage 1 works, please refer to the Statement of Heritage Impact (RPS 2014).

1.3 Limitations

This desktop assessment is based on a limited description of the proposed utility works only. No plans or diagrams were provided.

1.4 Authorship

This report has been prepared by RPS Sydney CBD Heritage Manager, Deborah Farina, and reviewed by RPS Senior Manager – Cultural Heritage, Erin Williams. RPS would like to acknowledge its appreciation to the following in completing this investigation:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Organisation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Braith Gilchrist</td>
<td>SMEC</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## 2.0 Significance and Impact Assessment

In the assessment of the Stage 1 Statement of Heritage Impact, RPS assessed the significance of the item as being of high local significance based on its historical significance and rarity. The significance assessment is reproduced below.

### 2.1 Significance Assessment

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>Former Holland’s Orchard and Commemorative Grove Adjacent to Warringah Road and within The Forest High School Grounds Lot 2, DP 234702 Warringah LEP 2011 (I62)</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A – Historical Significance</td>
<td>The remaining pear tree on Warringah Road and the propagated trees within the grounds of Forest High School are the last physical remains of Holland’s large orchard that once occupied this area during the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Agriculture, and particularly fruit-growing, was the impetus for settlement of the area and therefore important part of the development of Frenchs Forest. The remaining trees from that orchard therefore satisfy this criterion at a local level to a high degree.</td>
<td>Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B – Associative Significance</td>
<td>Although the remaining trees have a strong association with John Holland and his fellow orchardists, it must be borne in mind that there were several orchards and orchardists all operating in the vicinity at the same time. As John Holland was one of many orchardists and agriculturists, the importance of his orchard in the development is as one of a group and therefore not strong enough individually to satisfy this criterion.</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C – Aesthetic Significance</td>
<td>The remaining trees are not of aesthetic significance and are not considered to meet this criterion.</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D – Social Significance</td>
<td>The propagation of trees and replanting within The Forest High School grounds is indicative of the level of significance of these trees to the local community.</td>
<td>Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E – Research Potential</td>
<td>The pear variety may be of heirloom variety and as such is considered to have local research potential.</td>
<td>Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F – Rarity</td>
<td>Generally, pear trees are not rare in NSW or the local area however the pear tree on Warringah Road is a rare surviving example of the trees belonging to the orchard and may be of a rare or unusual heirloom variety.</td>
<td>Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Criterion</td>
<td>Former Holland’s Orchard and Commemorative Grove Adjacent to Warringah Road and within The Forest High School Grounds Lot 2, DP 234702 Warringah LEP 2011 (I62)</td>
<td>Significance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Significance</strong></td>
<td>As the tree represents a phase of the historical development of Frenchs Forest, and given the number of orchards that were once present in the area, the last remaining tree is assessed as being a rare example of orchard trees in the local area.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>G – Representative</strong></td>
<td>The pear trees are representative of the types of orchards that occupied much of the landscape prior to residential subdivision and therefore meet this criterion to a local level.</td>
<td>Local</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Integrity and Intactness</strong></td>
<td>When first assessed in 2000, there were two trees, initially recorded as apple trees. A subsequent assessment as part of the Warringah Heritage Study noted that they were in fact pear trees and that one had died in the interim (Plate 9). In 2005, a number of trees were propagated from the remaining tree on Warringah Road and planted as a grove in the grounds of Forest High School in commemoration of Holland’s orchard that once stood there. The curtilage of this heritage item is in the process of being amended by Warringah Council to include this propagated grove, to note the death of one of the original trees and that they are in fact pear trees. The grove of trees within Forest High School appears in good health and intact. The surviving pear tree on Warringah Road also appears in good health; however an arborist should be consulted regarding its future management.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Statement of Heritage Significance</strong></td>
<td>This item is of local significance for historic, social, research, rarity and representative reasons. The last remaining pear tree from the Holland’s orchard is the last surviving tangible link to the many orchards that made up the area and encouraged settlement in the Frenchs Forest area. Based on its historical significance and rarity, it is assessed as being of high local significance.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## 2.2 Impact Assessment

The Former Holland’s Orchard and Commemorative Grove is a heritage item comprising the remaining pear tree from a large orchard once on the site of The Forest High School, and a commemorative grove within the high school comprising cuttings of that remaining tree. The remaining tree was once one of two trees, with the other tree dying at some time before 2005. The death of that tree prompted the propagation program resulting in the Commemorative Grove located within the grounds of The Forest High School. The heritage item will be partially impacted, in that the only remaining pear tree from the Former Holland’s Orchard lies within the pathway of the proposed works. Given its location adjacent to the pedestrian path on the verge between the northern side of Warringah Road and the southern boundary fence of Forest High School, any widening to either the footpath or Warringah Road would cause impact to the tree.

In part, the item's significance is based on the rarity of the remaining tree. Once that tree dies or is destroyed, the significance of the overall item will be affected. However, the current location of the tree, approximately two metres from the kerb of Warringah Road, means that the tree is currently located in an incongruous setting. Further, its proximity to Warringah Road exposes the tree to a higher potential of damage through road accidents or vandalism.
Consideration should therefore be given to removing the tree and replanting it within the Commemorative Grove within the boundaries of the Forest High School. Whilst normally the removal of any heritage item from its original location lessens its significance that does not hold true in this case. The removal of the pear tree to the Commemorative Grove would place the tree back an orchard environment. If its removal is successful, it may also increase the significance of the commemorative grove by its presence. It may also provide a safer environment for the tree to flourish and further opportunities for it to naturally propagate.
3.0 Mitigation Measures and Recommendation

The Former Holland’s Orchard and Commemorative Grove, listed in as a local heritage item in Schedule 5 of the Warringah Local Environmental Plan 2011, is anticipated to be impacted by the proposed utility works along Warringah Road. There is no alternative to undertaking the proposed works and keeping the tree in its current location.

It is concluded that the tree is currently in an incongruous location. It would be preferable to remove the tree to within the Commemorative Grove to place in back to an environment closer to its original context. This could only be done, however, if an arborist can confirm that the tree is able to survive a transplant.

The following management recommendations have been formulated with consideration of all available information and have been prepared in accordance with the relevant legislation.

**Recommendation 1 – Management of pear tree**

It is recommended that the pear tree be examined by a qualified and experienced arborist prior to any management measures being undertaken. If the arborist concludes that it is healthy enough to be moved, then consultation should be undertaken with Warringah Council and the Department of Education regarding such a move. Should the arborist conclude that it is not healthy enough to be moved, it is recommended that the tree be propagated further and photographically recorded.
Appendix 1

Inventory Sheet from State Heritage Inventory
Hollands Orchard (Former)

Item details

Name of item: Hollands Orchard (Former)
Other name/s: Hollands Orchard
Type of item: Landscape
Primary address: adjacent to Warringah Road, Frenchs Forest, NSW 2086
Local govt. area: Warringah

All addresses

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Street Address</th>
<th>Suburb/town</th>
<th>LGA</th>
<th>Parish</th>
<th>County</th>
<th>Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>adjacent to Warringah Road</td>
<td>Frenchs Forest</td>
<td>Warringah</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Primary Address</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Statement of significance:

A rare remnant of an early orchard, which demonstrates that horticultural activities were carried out in the area at the turn of the 20th century. Provides evidence of the association of social, cultural & eduational qualities in the locality.

Note: There are incomplete details for a number of items listed in NSW. The Heritage Branch intends to develop or upgrade statements of significance and other information for these items as resources become available.

Description

Construction years: 1900-
Physical description: Remnant plantings consisting of two apple trees approximately 4 metres in height with honeysuckle vine at the base of the trees.

History

Historical notes: "Hollands Orchard" was established around the turn of the century on the northern side of Warringah Road, where Frenchs Forest High School is now.

Historic themes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Australian theme (abbrev)</th>
<th>New South Wales theme</th>
<th>Local theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3. Economy- Developing local, regional and national economies</td>
<td>Agriculture-Activities relating to the cultivation and rearing of plant and animal species, usually for commercial purposes, can include aquaculture</td>
<td>(none)-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
8. Culture-
Developing cultural institutions and ways of life

Creative endeavours—Activities associated with the production and performance of literary, artistic, architectural and other imaginative, interpretive or inventive works; and/or associated with the production and expression of cultural phenomena; and/or environments that have inspired such creative activities.

Recommended management:
Significance of the two apple trees should be recognised by statutory heritage listing.

Listings

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heritage Listing</th>
<th>Listing Title</th>
<th>Listing Number</th>
<th>Gazette Date</th>
<th>Gazette Number</th>
<th>Gazette Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Local Environmental Plan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>05 Dec 00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Study details

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Inspected by</th>
<th>Guidelines used</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Warringah Heritage Study</td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>Major Local Significance</td>
<td>Warringah Council</td>
<td>No</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

References, internet links & images

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Internet Links</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Written</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Field inspection and oral source</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: internet links may be to web pages, documents or images.

(Click on thumbnail for full size image and image details)

Data source

The information for this entry comes from the following source:
Name: Local Government
Database number: 2610091

Return to previous page

Every effort has been made to ensure that information contained in the State Heritage Inventory is correct. If you find any errors or omissions please send your comments to the Database Manager.

All information and pictures on this page are the copyright of the Heritage Branch or respective copyright owners.